

Textbook and Instructional Materials Quality Commission Meeting Minutes

September 22, 2022

September 22, 2022

10:00 A.M. to 2:30 P.M. CST

Location

In Person:
Cordell Hull State Office Building
Hearing Room 1
425 Rep. John Lewis Way N
Nashville, TN 37243

Livestream: http://tnga.granicus.com/MediaPlayer.php?publish_id=f9ed885e-3b17-4008-ab6f-b02ec3ddb06

1. **Welcome & Introductions**

a. Call to Order

Dr. Linda Cash, Commission Chair

b. Roll Call

Ms. Tabatha Siddiqi, Recording Secretary, Tennessee Department of Education

Mr. Mike Bell	Present
Mr. William "Billy" Bryan	Present
Dr. Linda Cash	Present
Ms. Deborah "Deb" Chancellor	Present
Dr. John Combs	Present
Ms. Laurie Cordoza-Moore	Absent
Mr. Daniel French	Absent
Dr. Mark Gonyea	Absent
Dr. Kathy Hickie	Present
Ms. Lee Houston	Present
Dr. Lisa Coons (Non-voting Commissioner Designee)	Present

Quorum Confirmed

c. Introductions of Commission Members

Dr. Linda Cash, Commission Chair

- Dr Cash requested new member Mr. Mike Bell confirm his oath of office. He indicated that he had completed his oath.

2. Consent Items (Voice Vote)

a. Adoption of Agenda

Dr. Linda Cash, Commission Chair

Motion to adopt September 22, 2022 agenda made by: Mr. Mike Bell

Motion seconded by: Dr. Kathy Hickie

Dr. Linda Cash, Commission Chair, requested a voice vote

Mr. Mike Bell	Aye
Mr. William "Billy" Bryan	Aye
Dr. Linda Cash	Aye
Ms. Deborah "Deb" Chancellor	Aye
Dr. John Combs	Aye
Ms. Laurie Cordoza-Moore	Absent
Mr. Daniel French	Absent
Dr. Mark Gonyea	Absent
Dr. Kathy Hickie	Aye
Ms. Lee Houston	Aye

Agenda unanimously approved

3. Action Items (Roll Call Vote)

a. Approval of Minutes, July 25, 2022

Dr. Linda Cash, Commission Chair

Motion to adopt July 25, 2022 meeting minutes made by: Mr. William "Billy" Bryan

Motion seconded by: Dr. John Combs

Dr. Linda Cash, Commission Chair, requested a voice vote

Mr. Mike Bell	Aye
Mr. William "Billy" Bryan	Aye
Dr. Linda Cash	Aye
Ms. Deborah "Deb" Chancellor	Aye
Dr. John Combs	Aye
Ms. Laurie Cordoza-Moore	Absent
Mr. Daniel French	Absent
Dr. Mark Gonyea	Absent
Dr. Kathy Hickie	Aye
Ms. Lee Houston	Aye

Minutes unanimously approved

b. Acknowledging Public Comments

Dr. Linda Cash, Commission Chair

- 5 Comments have been submitted to the department.
- Of the 5, all comments related to materials we reviewed and passed as a commission in July with the exception of Bridges.
- Bridges was not submitted for review by the publisher for review by this Commission
- No vote needed..

c. Curriculum Associates

Dr. Linda Cash, Commission Chair

- This speaker withdrew their request to speak before the Commission.

4. **Publisher Appeals**

Dr. Cash clarified that publishers were being provided additional time to speak due to the nature of the appeals process. Publishers appealing a single grade band were provided 10 minutes. Publishers appealing multiple grade bands were provided 30 minutes. Dr. Cash noted that this was longer than they were typically

Dr. Cash requested that Dr. Coons serve as timekeeper for the presentations in her capacity as secretary to the Commission.

Dr. Cash described the process for the appeals as follows:

- Publishers were asked to present and stay within their allotted time.
- The Commission will ask questions of the publisher.
- The Commission will seek guidance from subject matter experts from the department
- The Commission will vote on acceptance of the appeal. A vote of yes means the material will be included on the recommended approval list. A vote of no means the materials will not be included on the approval list.

a. Accelerate Learning (30 minutes)

Dr. Linda Cash, Commission Chair

- Presenters: Amanda McGee & Marty Clark

- K-5 digital.
- Added new lessons & whole scopes
- Created new lesson plans geared toward our standards in all competing grades.
- Mr. William “Billy” Bryan – Are lesson by sheet or discussion?
- Publisher – These math lessons are interactive & collaborative. Plus, the materials can be edited by the teacher to become even more interactive.
- Ms. Deborah “Deb” Chancellor – Will the information be available in hardcover?
- Publisher – Yes.
- Ms. Deborah “Deb” Chancellor – Do the materials being presented today by your company contain instruction on 100% of the TN math standards for each grade/course you are appealing?
- Publisher – Yes.
- Dr. Kathy Hickie – Did your company address all of the areas of concern noted by the advisory panelists?
- Publisher – Yes.
- Dr. John Combs – In the revisions, did you explicitly address deficiencies noted in your quality score as well as deficiencies with the inclusion of standards?
- Publisher – Yes.
- Dr. Linda Cash – Were our rigor requests reasonable?
- Publisher – Yes.
- Mr. William “Billy” Bryan to the Subject Matter Experts (SMEs) – Did the review panel find the publisher met the standards required & addressed the concerns of the SMEs?
- Ms. Virginia Mayfield (SME) – Yes.
- Dr. Linda Cash – Do the appealed materials meet the desired quality score set forth by this Commission?
- Ms. Virginia Mayfield (SME) – Yes.
- Dr. John Combs – Have the difficulties in delivering materials been addressed (paper shortage)?
- Publisher – Yes and they confirm the delivery next August will be in a timely manner.

Dr. Linda Cash, Commission Chair, requested a roll call voice vote for Accelerate Learning Materials presented on appeal.

	Kindergarten, G3, G6, G7, G8, & Algebra 1
Mr. Mike Bell	Aye
Mr. William “Billy” Bryan	Aye
Dr. Linda Cash	Aye
Ms. Deborah “Deb” Chancellor	Aye
Dr. John Combs	Aye
Ms. Laurie Cordoza-Moore	Absent
Mr. Daniel French	Absent
Dr. Mark Gonyea	Absent

Dr. Kathy Hickie	Aye
Ms. Lee Houston	Aye
	Passed

b. Big Ideas Learning (10 minutes)

Dr. Linda Cash, Commission Chair

- Presenter – Amanda Wiley & Emily Winston
- Passed G6, G7, G8, Algebra 1, & Geometry.
- Revised 80% of chapters and 21% of lessons.
- Added 110 new citations to clarify covered standards
- Ms. Deborah “Deb” Chancellor – Do the materials being presented today by your company contain instruction on 100% of the TN math standards for each grade/course you are appealing?
- Publisher – Yes.
- Dr. John Combs – In the revisions, did you explicitly address deficiencies noted in your quality score as well as deficiencies with the inclusion of standards?
- Publisher – Yes.
- Dr. Kathy Hickie – Did your company address all of the areas of concern noted by the advisory panelists?
- Publisher – Yes.
- Mr. William “Billy” Bryan to the Subject Matter Experts (SMEs) – Did the review panel find the publisher met the 100% standards required & addressed the concerns of the SMEs?
- Ms. Virginia Mayfield (SME) – Yes.
- Dr. John Combs – Have the difficulties in delivering materials been addressed (paper shortage)?
- Publisher – Yes and, due to paper shortages, they are ordering supplies now for fall implementation.

Dr. Linda Cash, Commission Chair, requested a roll call voice vote for Big Ideas Learning Materials presented on appeal.

	Algebra 2
Mr. Mike Bell	Aye
Mr. William “Billy” Bryan	Aye
Dr. Linda Cash	Aye
Ms. Deborah “Deb” Chancellor	Aye
Dr. John Combs	Aye
Ms. Laurie Cordoza-Moore	Absent
Mr. Daniel French	Absent
Dr. Mark Gonyea	Absent

Dr. Kathy Hickie	Aye
Ms. Lee Houston	Aye
	Passed

c. Cengage Learning (10 minutes)

Dr. Linda Cash, Commission Chair

- Presenter – Sebastian Andino
- Precalculus: Mathematics for Calculus – Two concerns
- Precalculus with Limits: A Graphic Approach
- Understanding Basic Statistics
- Correlations not in printed text can be provided in separate supplemental correlation document.
- Ms. Deborah “Deb” Chancellor – Do the materials being presented today by your company contain instruction on 100% of the TN math standards for each grade/course you are appealing?
- Publisher – Nothing was added because everything was already there.
- Dr. Kathy Hickie – In the revisions, did you explicitly address deficiencies noted in your quality score as well as deficiencies with the inclusion of standards?
- Publisher – Yes.
- Dr. John Combs – Have the difficulties in delivering materials been addressed (paper shortage)?
- Publisher – Working diligently to ensure this.
- Dr. John Combs to the Subject Matter Experts (SMEs) – Did the review panel find the publisher met the 100% standards required & addressed the concerns of the SMEs?
- Ms. Virginia Mayfield (SME) – Not in Precalculus. Statistics met 100% of the requirements. In the precalculus materials, there are standards not represented as indicated in the materials submitted by the publisher. For standard P.F.GT.A.2 the materials submitted indicated “This standard is not directly addressed in this edition”

Dr. Linda Cash, Commission Chair, requested a separate roll call voice vote for each subject for Cengage materials.

	Three Precalculus Materials	Statistics
Mr. Mike Bell	Nay	Aye
Mr. William “Billy” Bryan	Nay	Aye
Dr. Linda Cash	Nay	Aye
Ms. Deborah “Deb” Chancellor	Nay	Aye
Dr. John Combs	Nay	Aye
Ms. Laurie Cordoza-Moore	Absent	Absent
Mr. Daniel French	Absent	Absent

Dr. Mark Gonyea	Absent	Absent
Dr. Kathy Hickie	Nay	Aye
Ms. Lee Houston	Nay	Aye
	Did not pass	Passed

d. Houghton Mifflin Harcourt (HMH) (10 minutes)

Dr. Linda Cash, Commission Chair

- Presenter – Penny Dowdy
- Rigor focused on conceptual, fluency, and application
- Add 12 new success lessons
- Ms. Deborah “Deb” Chancellor – Were the bids for the other grades withdrawn?
- Publisher – Yes.
- Dr. John Combs – In the revisions, did you explicitly address deficiencies noted in your quality score as well as deficiencies with the inclusion of standards?
- Publisher – Yes.
- Dr. Kathy Hickie – Did your company address all of the areas of concern noted by the advisory panelists?
- Publisher – Yes.
- Dr. John Combs – Have the difficulties in delivering materials been addressed (paper shortage)?
- Publisher – Yes. There are multiple plans of delivery in place and all books will be in the warehouse in July.

Dr. Linda Cash, Commission Chair, requested a roll call voice vote for HMH materials presented on appeal.

	Algebra 2
Mr. Mike Bell	Aye
Mr. William “Billy” Bryan	Aye
Dr. Linda Cash	Aye
Ms. Deborah “Deb” Chancellor	Aye
Dr. John Combs	Aye
Ms. Laurie Cordoza-Moore	Absent
Mr. Daniel French	Absent
Dr. Mark Gonyea	Absent
Dr. Kathy Hickie	Aye
Ms. Lee Houston	Aye
	Passed

e. McGraw Hill (30 minutes)

Dr. Linda Cash, Commission Chair

- Presenter – Shelly McClanahan
- G3 – Created new TN lessons for teacher & digital
- Enhanced contextual support and the activity & guided exploration
- Added Math replay, mini-lessons, and a gaming format.
- G4 – Revised lessons 13-1, 13-3, and 13-3.
- Enhanced the “Learn” and “On My Own” pages
- G8 – Six new pages of instruction & six pages of practice
- Revised student, teacher, & digital experiences
- New platform can graph digitally
- Dr. Linda Cash – What about the TN teacher rubric?
- Publisher – We listened to Tennessee teachers and they indicated including rubric information would be helpful
- Ms. Deborah “Deb” Chancellor – Do the materials being presented today by your company contain instruction on 100% of the TN math standards for each grade/course you are appealing?
- Publisher – Yes. Precalculus was removed from the bid.
- Dr. Kathy Hickie – Did your company address all of the areas of concern noted by the advisory panelists?
- Publisher – Yes.
- Dr. John Combs – In the revisions, did you explicitly address deficiencies noted in your quality score as well as deficiencies with the inclusion of standards?
- Publisher – Yes.
- Ms. Virginia Mayfield (SME) – All grades met 100% of the requirements.
- Dr. John Combs – Have the difficulties in delivering materials been addressed (paper shortage)?
- Publisher – Absolutely.

Dr. Linda Cash, Commission Chair, requested a roll call voice vote for the McGraw Hill materials presented on appeal.

	G3, G4, & G8
Mr. Mike Bell	Aye
Mr. William “Billy” Bryan	Aye
Dr. Linda Cash	Aye
Ms. Deborah “Deb” Chancellor	Aye
Dr. John Combs	Aye
Ms. Laurie Cordoza-Moore	Absent
Mr. Daniel French	Absent
Dr. Mark Gonyea	Absent

Dr. Kathy Hickie	Aye
Ms. Lee Houston	Aye
	Passed

f. NS4ed (10 minutes)

Dr. Linda Cash, Commission Chair

- Presenter – Dr. Joseph Goins
- Based on the panelist review – every lesson was touched in Algebra 1, Algebra 2, and Geometry.
- All digital.
- Doubled up on TN standards
- Algebra 1 – Teachers have access to resource sites.
- Focus is career pathways in Math for job zones 3-5.
- Lessons involve wages & discussions with experienced workers.
- Ms. Deborah “Deb” Chancellor – Do the materials being presented today by your company contain instruction on 100% of the TN math standards for each grade/course you are appealing?
- Publisher – Yes.
- Dr. Kathy Hickie – Did your company address all of the areas of concern noted by the advisory panelists?
- Publisher – Yes.
- Dr. John Combs – In the revisions, did you explicitly address deficiencies noted in your quality score as well as deficiencies with the inclusion of standards?
- Publisher – Yes.
- Dr. John Combs – Have the difficulties in delivering materials been addressed (paper shortage)?
- Publisher – All digital so delivery is not an issue.

Dr. Linda Cash, Commission Chair, requested a roll call voice vote for NS4ed materials presented on appeal.

	Algebra 1, Algebra 2, and Geometry
Mr. Mike Bell	Aye
Mr. William “Billy” Bryan	Aye
Dr. Linda Cash	Aye
Ms. Deborah “Deb” Chancellor	Aye
Dr. John Combs	Aye
Ms. Laurie Cordoza-Moore	Absent
Mr. Daniel French	Absent
Dr. Mark Gonyea	Absent
Dr. Kathy Hickie	Aye

Ms. Lee Houston	Aye
	Passed

g. Open Up Resources (30 minutes)

Dr. Linda Cash, Commission Chair

- Presenter – Christopher Child
- High quality resources are free.
- Good for new and veteran educators
- Created new lessons for each grade level using TN Standards
- Algebra 1, Algebra 2, and Geometry added lessons to help support family involvement.
- Teach addressed all feedback for review panelists.
- Ms. Deborah “Deb” Chancellor – Do the materials being presented today by your company contain instruction on 100% of the TN math standards for each grade/course you are appealing?
- Publisher – Yes.
- Dr. Kathy Hickie – Did your company address all of the areas of concern noted by the advisory panelists?
- Publisher – Yes.
- Dr. John Combs – In the revisions, did you explicitly address deficiencies noted in your quality score as well as deficiencies with the inclusion of standards?
- Publisher – Yes.
- Dr. John Combs – Have the difficulties in delivering materials been addressed (paper shortage)?
- Publisher – Yes. Primarily digital but printed materials are also available.
- Ms. Virginia Mayfield (SME) – All grades met 100% of the requirements.

Dr. Linda Cash, Commission Chair, requested a roll call voice vote for the Open Up Resources materials presented on appeal.

	K-G3, G5-G8, Algebra 1, Algebra 2, & Geometry
Mr. Mike Bell	Aye
Mr. William “Billy” Bryan	Aye
Dr. Linda Cash	Aye
Ms. Deborah “Deb” Chancellor	Aye
Dr. John Combs	Aye
Ms. Laurie Cordoza-Moore	Absent
Mr. Daniel French	Absent
Dr. Mark Gonyea	Absent
Dr. Kathy Hickie	Aye

Ms. Lee Houston	Aye
	Passed

h. Pearson Virtual Schools (30 minutes)

- Presenters – Michael DiPierro & Nicole Gilwee
- Online education provider
- Serves 110,000 students
- Focus is on analysis, development, and ready for students
- Publisher was presenting on the curriculum as it stands and not how things had been revised to meet TN requirements.
- Dr. Linda Cash – Were all references to Common Core State Standards (CCSS) removed for submitted materials?
- Publisher – All references will be removed by the time of distribution.
- Ms. Deborah “Deb” Chancellor – Do the materials being presented today by your company contain instruction on 100% of the TN math standards for each grade/course you are appealing?
- Publisher – Yes.
- Dr. Kathy Hickie – Did your company address all of the areas of concern noted by the advisory panelists?
- Publisher – Addressed quality structure.
- Dr. John Combs to SMEs– In the revisions, deficiencies noted in your quality score as well as deficiencies with the inclusion of standards?
- Publisher – Yes.
- Mr. Mike Bell to SMEs – Were all references removed regarding CCSS?
- Ms. Lee Houston – Is CCSS in the approved materials?
- Ms. Virginia Mayfield – No. References to CCSS are still in the resubmitted material in the math practices and in the previously approved G4, G5, & Calculus.
- Dr. Linda Cash – If CCSS is in the approved curriculum, it will also require a vote today.

Dr. Linda Cash, Commission Chair, requested a motion to vote on today’s materials and materials previously approved

Motion to add G4, G5, and Calculus to today’s vote made by: Mr. Mike Bell

Motion seconded by: Dr. John Combs

Dr. Linda Cash, Commission Chair, requested a roll call voice vote

Mr. Mike Bell	Aye
Mr. William “Billy” Bryan	Aye
Dr. Linda Cash	Aye
Ms. Deborah “Deb” Chancellor	Aye
Dr. John Combs	Aye

Ms. Laurie Cordoza-Moore	Absent
Mr. Daniel French	Absent
Dr. Mark Gonyea	Absent
Dr. Kathy Hickie	Aye
Ms. Lee Houston	Aye

Dr. Linda Cash, Commission Chair, requested a separate roll call voice vote for today's items and those previously approved for Pearson Virtual Materials.

	Today's Materials K-G3, G6-G8, Algebra 1, Algebra 2, Precalculus, & Geometry	Previously approved G4, G5, & Calculus
Mr. Mike Bell	Nay	Nay
Mr. William "Billy" Bryan	Nay	Nay
Dr. Linda Cash	Nay	Nay
Ms. Deborah "Deb" Chancellor	Nay	Nay
Dr. John Combs	Nay	Nay
Ms. Laurie Cordoza-Moore	Absent	Absent
Mr. Daniel French	Absent	Absent
Dr. Mark Gonyea	Absent	Absent
Dr. Kathy Hickie	Nay	Nay
Ms. Lee Houston	Nay	Nay
	Did not pass	Did not pass

- Dr. Lisa Coons will provide contact information for the TN State Board of Education virtual curriculum review.

i. Savvas Learning (10 minutes)

Dr. Linda Cash, Commission Chair

- Presenter – Phill Hester & Jenna Harden
- Created new content for the three Precalculus books pending approval, to address all TN Standards.
- The new content will appear in the back of the book and is cross referenced in the appendix.
- Ms. Deborah (Deb) Chancellor – Received Savvas curriculum information that contained CCSS.
- Publisher – Savvas offers two different editions. One with CCSS and one with non-CCSS. Your district received the wrong version.

- Dr. Kathy Hickie – Did your company address all of the areas of concern noted by the advisory panelists?
- Publisher – Yes.
- Dr. John Combs – In the revisions, did you explicitly address deficiencies noted in your quality score as well as deficiencies with the inclusion of standards?
- Publisher – Yes.
- Dr. John Combs – Have the difficulties in delivering materials been addressed (paper shortage)?
- Publisher – Yes.
- Ms. Virginia Mayfield (SME) – All grades met 100% of the requirements.

Dr. Linda Cash, Commission Chair, requested a roll call voice vote for the SAVVAS materials presented on appeal.

	Precalculus
Mr. Mike Bell	Aye
Mr. William “Billy” Bryan	Aye
Dr. Linda Cash	Aye
Ms. Deborah “Deb” Chancellor	Aye
Dr. John Combs	Aye
Ms. Laurie Cordoza-Moore	Absent
Mr. Daniel French	Absent
Dr. Mark Gonyea	Absent
Dr. Kathy Hickie	Aye
Ms. Lee Houston	Aye
	Passed

j. Zearn (30 minutes)

Dr. Linda Cash, Commission Chair

- Jenna Johnson & Kyle Falting
- Title 1 (c)(3) Organization
- 30 standards were flagged and all were addressed.
- Created new content for all of the lessons.
- Ms. Deborah “Deb” Chancellor – Do the materials being presented today by your company contain instruction on 100% of the TN math standards for each grade/course you are appealing?
- Publisher – Yes.
- Dr. Kathy Hickie – Did your company address all of the areas of concern noted by the advisory panelists? For specific lessons?
- Publisher – Yes.

- Dr. John Combs – In the revisions, did you explicitly address deficiencies noted in your quality score as well as deficiencies with the inclusion of standards?
- Publisher – Yes.
- Dr. John Combs – Have the difficulties in delivering materials been addressed (paper shortage)?
- Publisher – Yes, due to free online access. Schools can also order extra services when they create a school account.
- Ms. Virginia Mayfield (SME) – All grades met 100% of the requirements.

Dr. Linda Cash, Commission Chair, requested a roll call voice vote for the Zearn materials presented on appeal.

	K-G3 & G6-G8
Mr. Mike Bell	Aye
Mr. William “Billy” Bryan	Aye
Dr. Linda Cash	Aye
Ms. Deborah “Deb” Chancellor	Aye
Dr. John Combs	Aye
Ms. Laurie Cordoza-Moore	Absent
Mr. Daniel French	Absent
Dr. Mark Gonyea	Absent
Dr. Kathy Hickie	Aye
Ms. Lee Houston	Aye
	Passed

- k. Confirm Special Called Meeting Date in November 2022
 Dr. Linda Cash, Commission Chair
- November 9, 2022 confirmed

5. 2023 Meeting Dates

Dr. Linda Cash, Commission Chair

Tentative Special Called Meeting – November 9, 2022

- In-person
- Davy Crockett Building (pending confirmation) at 10 am CT

Next Regular Meeting: January 19, 2023

- Confirmed

- Location pending
-

6. Other Business from the Commission

Dr. Linda Cash, Commission Chair

- No other business
-

Meeting adjourned by Commissioner Chair Dr. Linda Cash at: 2:19 P.M. CT

DRAFT